

Dear

.....

Editorial board of the Journal Informacije MIDEM chose you to act as a reviewer of the sent article. Based on your judgement the board will decide whether to publish or refuse the contribution. Please, return the form giving also written opinion about the contribution.

We are expecting your answer within 14 days.

Uredništvo revije " Informacije MIDEM " Vas je izbralo za recenzenta priloženega prispevka. Na osnovi Vašega mnenja se bo uredništvo odločilo za objavo ali zavrnitev prispevka. Prosim, poleg obrazca podajte tudi pismeno mnenje o prispevku.

PROSIM ZA STROKOVNO RECENZIJO ČLANKA V ROKU 14 DNI PO PREJETJU.

Author :	Title :
Deborah.S, Jayanthi.T, N.Victor Jaya	Linearly Polarized 4x4 Microstrip Patch Antenna Array with corporate feed for X-band applications

Ljubljana :

Editor-in-chief
 Marko Topič:

REVIEW POINTS

(MERILA ZA RECENZIJU)

	YES	NO	Partially
Is the contribution content appropriate for publishing? <i>Ali je prispevek dovolj tehten in vsebinsko primeren za objavo ?</i>		X	
Is the content on the appropriate scientific level? <i>Ali je vsebina na ustrezni znanstveno strokovni ravni ?</i>		X	
Has the contribution been published in the same or similar form before ? where? <i>Ali je bil material že objavljen v takšni ali podobni obliki ? Kje ?</i>			X
Is the contribution prepared according to instructions for authors? <i>Ali je prispevek napisan in opremljen v skladu z navodili za avtorje ?</i>	X		
Is data reliable and documents the findings appropriately ? <i>Ali so podatki zanesljivi in zadostno dokumentirajo ugotovitve ?</i>		X	

REVIEWER'S EXPLANATION :

OBRAZLOŽITEV RECENZENTA :

Popular commercial designs like 5GHz WLAN or 9GHz shipborne radar have used for many years far more advanced microstrip patch arrays that the one proposed in the above paper.
No coordinate system is specified in the article nor the nonstandard mathematical symbols (delta being used in place of nabla?).
All microstrip patches suffer poor efficiency due to copper losses. The latter is not simulated nor measured in the article.
The measured radiation patterns suggest a directivity of about 13dBi. The estimated radiation efficiency is around 50% due to the long feedlines. The overall gain is therefore around 10dBi or much less than specified in the article.

SUGGESTIONS TO THE EDITORIAL BOARD:

PREDLOGI UREDNIŠTVU :

- ◇ The contribution can be accepted as original scientific work (prispevek lahko sprejmete kot izvirno znanstveno delo)
- ◇ The contribution can be accepted as professional work (prispevek lahko sprejmete kot strokovno delo)
- ◇ The contribution can be accepted as an overview work (prispevek lahko sprejmete kot pregledno delo)
- ◇ The contribution can be accepted after corrections (prispevek lahko sprejmete po popravkih)
- ◇ the contribution is to be rejected (prispevek zavrnite)

Reviewer (Recenzijo opravil)	Date (datum) :
Matjaž Vidmar	05.01.2018